Patients Are Units? Neurosurgery Denied for over 70?

Apparently back on November 22, 2011, during the Mark Levin show on WLS 890, a caller stating he was a ‘brain surgeon’ called ‘Jeff’, driving from Chicago to Detroit and came back from a conference of CNS/AANS in Washington, D.C. said something to the effect of: patients were called Units and that if someone 70+ years of age needed neurosurgery they would only be given ‘comfort care’. ‘Jeff’ went on to mention HUDS or Humanitarian Use Devices, although I can’t figure out what they had to do with anything.

Now please do NOT think I was for this monstrosity of a healthcare bill, as I was NOT! Plus I actually read the dang thing as it got passed and signed into law, and have a few things that really concern me with it:

- By the bill’s own economic studies, it does nothing to help with the increasing number of consumer/patients that are under or un insured. In fact since the bill has passed, the numbers have only increased. Yet alone the rising cost of healthcare in general.
- It creates a number of advisories, boards, committees, councils and panels to determine appropriate medical process, treatment and procedure. All these advisories, boards, committees, councils and panels are populated NOT with medical professionals but with bureaucrats, attorneys and politicians instead. (Don’t know about you, but if I have heart trouble I want a cardiac specialist and NOT my attorney or politician to tell me my options, etc.)
- It accumulates funds by ‘robbing Peter to pay Paul’ for 2 years before the first rollout in 2013. Not only that, but some of that money shuffling has removed some of my existing RX benefits and no matter where I search the dang blasted bill, these particular benefits are never returned in any of the three rollouts (2013, 2016, 2019).
- The first rendition of the bill had 103 circular references or loopholes and when it was passed it still contained 70 of them. Most of which concerned funding, the power of these advisories, boards, committees, councils and panels and the rollouts.

But I digress … Back to this phone call …
Current searches at http://www.MarkLevinShow.com/ for “call from neurosurgeon” and “call from brain surgeon” produced NO results.

When I go to the web site for that show http://www.marklevinshow.com/Article.asp?id=2340235&spid=32345, it appears that although the web page for that days show discusses the call, the call itself is no longer on the site.

You can, however, still find the recording on uTube in several places.
On top of that when following the link from FactCheck.org (http://podfuse-dl.andomedia.com/800185/podfuse-origin.andomedia.com/citadel_origin/pods/marklevin/Levin11222011.mp3) you will get some previous tapes of Milton Friedman on economics. Now links to these tapes are found on the Mark Levin Show page for that particular podcast (as you can see in the screen shots).

Now I will admit that I only listened for 15 minutes of the link above, and then shut down because there was nothing about pencils or healthcare in the first 15 minutes.

Dear old ‘Jeff the brain surgeon’ is nowhere to be found. There is not a listing for him in either the Congress of Neurosurgeons (CNS) or American Association of Neurosurgeons (AANS); the Washington
D.C. conference of these organizations did not have any government documents or the like concerning this subject, nor did it discuss anything involving the withholding of healthcare or comfort care or the like for the 70+ crowd.

When I search for the phrases of:

- Patients are Units
- Neurosurgery Denied for over 70
- Comfort Care
- Phone call from neurosurgeon or phone call from brain surgeon

I get all kinds of results as this has apparently gone viral on the internet. However, I am saddened to say that some of my favorite sites are also passing this information on down the line.

This bugs me to no end, because when I try to explain that exaggerating or miss quoting or spreading untruths, only harms our cause and nothing else – People get all defensive or downright nasty when these mistruths are pointed out. I just don’t understand why, since are we or are we not, attempting to show how smart, intelligent and logical we are?

There is NO documentation trail and the farther away from the original broadcast date, the less information there is (I’ve checked again in 2013 and there is less now than back in 2011). Which stresses that unfortunately this particular piece of information is NOT based in fact and cannot be confirmed.

Remember

\[\text{Ignorance is never having the opportunity to learn;} \]
\[\text{Dumb is being unable to learn and} \]
\[\text{Stupid is having had the opportunity to learn and not doing so.}\]

Below is some information from a few ‘Truth or Not’ type sites as well as the link to the official denial from CNS/AANS.

Read the CNS/AANS statement yourself at: [http://www.cns.org/advocacy/wc/pdf/MarkLevinStatementFINAL.PDF](http://www.cns.org/advocacy/wc/pdf/MarkLevinStatementFINAL.PDF)

**Neurosurgeons Decry False Assertions Made About Health Reform Law on Mark Levin Show**

Refute Statements that the Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act Would Ration Neurosurgical Care
Washington, DC – On November 22, 2011, an individual claiming to be a “brain surgeon” made several statements referencing neurosurgical care on a Mark Levin radio show segment. The American Association of Neurological Surgeons (AANS) and the Congress of Neurological Surgeons (CNS) reviewed this segment and found that it contained several factual inaccuracies which we wish to clarify.

The AANS and CNS are unaware of any federal government document directing that advanced neurosurgery for patients over 70 years of age will not be indicated and only supportive care treatment will be provided. Furthermore, in conducting our own due diligence, the caller who identified himself as a brain surgeon is not actually a neurosurgeon, nor was there any session at the recent Congress of Neurological Surgeons’ scientific meeting in Washington, DC at which a purported government document calling for the rationing of neurosurgical care was discussed.

Neurosurgeons are committed to providing timely, compassionate, and state of the art treatment for all patients -- regardless of age -- who have neurosurgical conditions. As such, we have requested numerous times that this podcast be removed from Mark Levin’s website as it portrays inaccurate information which could potentially be harmful to the patients that we serve.

The American Association of Neurological Surgeons (AANS), founded in 1931, and the Congress of Neurological Surgeons (CNS), founded in 1951, are the two largest scientific and educational associations for neurological surgeons in the world. These groups represent over 8,000 neurosurgeons worldwide. Neurological surgery is the medical specialty concerned with the prevention, diagnosis, treatment and rehabilitation of disorders that affect the entire nervous system, including the spinal column, spinal cord, brain and peripheral nerves. For more information, please visit www.aans.org or www.cns.org.

http://www.factcheck.org/2012/01/neurological-death-panels/

Neurological ‘Death Panels’?

Posted on January 5, 2012

Q: Does Obama plan to deny emergency brain surgery for patients over 70?

A: No. A man claiming on a radio talk show to be a brain surgeon lied about that, and about a meeting of two associations of neurological surgeons, those associations say.

FULL ANSWER

Several readers have asked us about a YouTube clip (http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=0wsnHGiSK-E) of comments made by a caller to The Mark Levin Show, a nationally syndicated conservative radio talk show, on Nov. 22, 2011. The caller, who is identified only as “Jeff” from Chicago on the show (http://podfuse-dl.andomedia.com/800185/podfuse-origin.andomedia.com/citadel_origin/pods/marklevin/Levin11222011.mp3), says that he is a brain surgeon and that the Department of Health and Human Services had issued a document saying
patients over age 70 should receive “comfort care,” instead of neurological surgery. He says this is “absolutely” like the “death panels” that Sarah Palin had claimed would be part of the federal health care law.

Jeff (the caller): Basically, what the document stated was, if you’re over 70 and you’d come into an emergency room and you’re on government-supported health care that you get comfort care.

Levin: What a minute. ... What document and ... what’s the source for this?

Jeff: This is the Obama’s new health care plan for advanced neurosurgical care.

Levin: And who issued this, HHS?

Jeff: Yes, and basically they don’t call them patients, they call them units. And instead of, they call it ethics panels or ethics committees would get together and meet and decide where the money would go for hospitals. And basically for patients over 70 years of age that advanced neurosurgical care was not generally indicated.

Levin: So, it’s generally going to be denied?

Jeff: Yes, absolutely.

“Jeff” said that this document wasn’t public and that he had discussed it in Washington, D.C., at a seminar of the AANS and CNS — that’s the American Association of Neurological Surgeons and the Congress of Neurological Surgeons.

But the AANS and CNS issued a statement on Nov. 28, and updated it on Jan. 3, saying they aren’t aware of any such federal document, and there was no session discussing anything of the sort at the recent CNS meeting. The updated statement said the caller “is not actually a neurosurgeon.”

**AANS and CNS statement:** The AANS and CNS are unaware of any federal government document directing that advanced neurosurgery for patients over 70 years of age will not be indicated and only supportive care treatment will be provided. Furthermore, in conducting our own due diligence, the caller who identified himself as a brain surgeon is not actually a neurosurgeon, nor was there any session at the recent Congress of Neurological Surgeons’ scientific meeting in Washington, DC at which a purported government document calling for the rationing of neurosurgical care was discussed.

Alison Dye, a spokeswoman for the groups, told us that they know who the caller is and that he is not a brain surgeon or a neurosurgeon. “One of our neurosurgeons knows who he is, and they had a conversation,” she said. AANS/CNS declined to give the full name of “Jeff,” the caller, saying that he had asked the groups not to identify him. Dye did say he was in the medical field but was not registered at a recent CNS meeting in Washington, D.C., since he isn’t a neurosurgeon and isn’t part of the organization.

She agreed to pass along a message to both “Jeff” and the neurosurgeon who knows him, telling them that we would like to speak with them. We will update this article if we get a response from either person.
We also contacted the Department of Health and Human Services. Erin Shields, director of communications for health care, told us: “These false claims were simply made up by an anonymous call to a radio station. No such document exists and no such presentation took place. And, the American Association of Neurological Surgeons and the Congress of Neurological Surgeons have both gone on the record to denounce these false rumors as well.”

After Levin ended his conservation with “Jeff,” he told another caller that the supposed brain surgeon “was vetted by us. We know he is who he said he is.”

We have called and emailed the producer of the show to ask for more information about this person. We will update this article if we receive a response.

The AANS and CNS repeatedly have asked the show to remove that episode of the podcast from the website, but so far, that has not happened. The groups said: “Neurosurgeons are committed to providing timely, compassionate, and state of the art treatment for all patients — regardless of age — who have neurosurgical conditions. As such, we have requested numerous times that this podcast be removed from Mark Levin’s website as it portrays inaccurate information which could potentially be harmful to the patients that we serve.”

When Levin asked, “So Sarah Palin was right, we’re going to have these death panels?,” “Jeff” responded, “Oh, absolutely.” He then made a reference to Nazi Germany, saying: “I’m German by heritage, and I’ve read ‘The Rise and Fall of the Third Reich,’ and basically … they don’t call them patients, they call them units, and if you’re a unit above a certain age, you get comfort care instead of advanced neurosurgical intervention.”

He also talked about being in training for 10 years and doing surgery on patients at 2 in the morning. He claimed one of his former partners was “head of the Congress of Neurosurgeons.”

Again, the CNS says he’s not part of that group and not a neurosurgeon. We asked if there was any document about neurosurgery and patients over 70 that this caller could be exaggerating or misconstruing, but the spokeswoman told us the neurological groups have no idea what “Jeff” is talking about.

— Lori Robertson

Sources

Dye, Alison, spokeswoman, American Association of Neurological Surgeons/Congress of Neurological Surgeons. Phone interview with FactCheck.org. 4 Jan 2012.
Shields, Erin, director of communications for health care, Department of Health and Human Services. Email to FactCheck.org. 5 Jan 2012.

It's Not Brain Surgery

Claim: The Obama Health Care Plan disallows advanced neurosurgery for patients over 70.

FALSE

Examples:

[Collected via e-mail, December 2011]

MUST LISTEN This needs to go viral. A brain surgeon called into the Mark Levin show. If you are over 70 years of age and you go to the ER and you are on government supported care, you will get comfort care instead of surgery. A government panel (a group of people that know absolutely nothing about medicine) will decide if you can have surgery and it has been decided that it will be denied if you are over 70. Patients will also be called "units" instead of "patients". Sarah Palin was correct — DEATH PANELS!
**Origins:** On 22 November 2011, a caller to the [Mark Levin Show](http://www.marklevinshow.com) identified himself as a "brain surgeon" and said that he had just returned from a meeting in Washington, D.C., with the American Association of Neurological Surgeons and the Congress of Neurological Surgeons where "we were reading over what the Obama health care plan would be for advanced neurosurgery for patients over 70." According to the caller, at that meeting he viewed a document issued by the Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) which referred to patients over 70 years old as "units" and stated that if such patients were on "government-supported care" and needed "advanced neurosurgical care," "ethics panels" or "ethics committees" established by health care reform legislation would allow them to be provided with "comfort care" only, not neurosurgery.

In response, the American Association of Neurological Surgeons ([AANS](http://www.aans.org)) maintained that the information provided by the anonymous caller "contained several factual inaccuracies" and issued the following statement about it:

On November 22, 2011, an individual claiming to be a "brain surgeon" made several statements referencing neurosurgical care on a Mark Levin radio show segment. The American Association of Neurological Surgeons (AANS) and the Congress of Neurological Surgeons (CNS) reviewed this segment and found that it contained several factual inaccuracies which we wish to clarify.

The AANS and CNS are unaware of any federal government document directing that advanced neurosurgery for patients over 70 years of age will not be indicated and only supportive care treatment will be provided. Furthermore, in conducting our own due diligence, it appears that the caller who identified himself as a brain surgeon may not actually be a neurosurgeon, nor was there any session at the recent Congress of Neurological Surgeons' scientific meeting in Washington, DC at which a purported government document calling for the rationing of neurosurgical care was discussed.

Neurosurgeons are committed to providing timely, compassionate, and state of the art treatment for all patients — regardless of age — who have neurosurgical conditions. As such, we have requested that this podcast be removed from Mark Levin's website as it portrays inaccurate information which could potentially be harmful to the patients that we serve.

**Last updated:** 3 January 2012

Urban Legends Reference Pages © 1995-2012 by Barbara and David P. Mikkelson. This material may not be reproduced without permission. snopes and the snopes.com logo are registered service marks of snopes.com.
Bottom line: Let’s use our brains and NOT fall prey to the ‘divide and conquer’, ‘mudslinging’ or ‘finger pointing’ sensationalism to further our cause. This mentality only hurts us.

Plan for the Unexpected
Prepare for the Unthinkable
Amor yourself with Knowledge
Vote Smart – Not Because
Be Prepared – Not Scared

TNT

Keep On